



Public-Private Partnership in the Development of Sustainable Public Transportation Systems: A Literature Review

Rusli¹, Adi Asmara¹, Basri¹

¹Universitas Fajar Makassar

*Corresponding Author: Rusli

Article Info

Article History:

Received 15 September 2020

Revised 12 December 2020

Accepted: 25 December 2020

Keywords:

Public-Private Partnership, Sustainable Public Transportation, Sustainable Mobility, Transportation Infrastructure.

Abstract

The increasing demand for sustainable public transportation systems has encouraged governments worldwide to seek innovative approaches to infrastructure development and service delivery. Among these approaches, Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs) have emerged as a strategic mechanism for addressing financial constraints, improving operational efficiency, and supporting sustainable urban mobility. This study aims to identify and analyze the role of Public-Private Partnerships in the development of sustainable public transportation systems through a Systematic Literature Review (SLR). The review follows the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) framework to ensure a transparent and systematic selection of relevant studies. Academic articles published between 2015 and 2025 were collected from major scholarly databases, including Scopus, Web of Science, ScienceDirect, SpringerLink, and Google Scholar. The selected literature was analyzed using thematic analysis to identify key themes, trends, benefits, challenges, and critical success factors associated with PPP implementation in sustainable transportation projects. The findings reveal that PPPs contribute significantly to infrastructure financing, operational efficiency, technological innovation, service quality improvement, and environmental sustainability. Furthermore, PPPs facilitate risk sharing and accelerate the implementation of transportation projects that support sustainable urban development. However, the literature also highlights several challenges, including regulatory uncertainty, governance complexity, financial risks, and stakeholder management issues. The review further identifies strong institutional capacity, effective risk allocation, regulatory stability, stakeholder engagement, and sustainability integration as key determinants of PPP success. Overall, the study concludes that PPPs can serve as effective governance and financing mechanisms for sustainable public transportation development when supported by appropriate policy frameworks and institutional arrangements. These findings provide valuable insights for policymakers, practitioners, and researchers seeking to enhance the sustainability and effectiveness of future transportation infrastructure projects.

Introduction

Transportation plays a fundamental role in supporting economic growth, social inclusion, and environmental sustainability. As urbanization continues to accelerate worldwide, cities are facing increasing challenges related to traffic congestion, air pollution, greenhouse gas emissions, and inadequate transportation infrastructure (Goetz, 2019). Public transportation systems have emerged as a crucial solution for addressing these challenges by providing efficient, accessible, and environmentally friendly mobility options. Sustainable public transportation not only enhances urban mobility but also contributes to broader sustainable development goals by reducing dependence on

private vehicles, lowering carbon emissions, and improving social equity. Consequently, governments around the world are seeking innovative approaches to finance, develop, and manage transportation infrastructure capable of meeting growing mobility demands while ensuring long-term sustainability (Pojani et al., 2015).

However, developing and maintaining sustainable public transportation systems requires substantial financial resources, technical expertise, and institutional capacity. Many governments, particularly in developing countries, face budget constraints that limit their ability to invest adequately in transportation infrastructure (Gurara et al., 2018). The increasing demand for modern transit systems, including metro rail, bus rapid transit (BRT), light rail transit (LRT), and intelligent transportation systems, has widened the gap between infrastructure needs and available public funding. This financing challenge has encouraged policymakers to explore alternative mechanisms for infrastructure delivery, among which Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs) have become one of the most prominent approaches (Trebilcock et al., 2015).

Public-Private Partnerships refer to long-term collaborative arrangements between public authorities and private-sector entities for the financing, construction, operation, and maintenance of public infrastructure and services (Cruz et al., 2017). PPPs aim to combine the strengths of both sectors, allowing governments to leverage private-sector capital, innovation, managerial expertise, and operational efficiency while retaining public oversight and accountability. Since the 1990s, PPPs have been increasingly adopted in transport infrastructure projects across various countries, including highways, railways, airports, ports, and urban transit systems (Osei et al., 2016). The rationale behind PPP implementation is that risk sharing, performance-based contracts, and private-sector participation can improve project efficiency and accelerate infrastructure development.

In the context of sustainable public transportation, PPPs are often viewed as a strategic mechanism for addressing infrastructure deficits while promoting environmental and social objectives (Yuan et al., 2018). The involvement of private partners can facilitate the adoption of advanced technologies, enhance service quality, improve operational efficiency, and support the implementation of environmentally sustainable transportation solutions. Research has shown that PPP arrangements can contribute to transportation sustainability through investments in green technologies, intelligent transportation systems, low-emission transit services, and integrated mobility solutions. Furthermore, PPPs can support the achievement of the United Nations Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), particularly those related to sustainable cities and communities, climate action, and resilient infrastructure (Zapatrina, 2016).

Despite these potential benefits, the implementation of PPPs in public transportation projects remains a subject of considerable debate among policymakers, researchers, and practitioners (Valila, 2020). Numerous studies have highlighted that PPP projects often face significant challenges, including complex contractual arrangements, regulatory uncertainty, political risks, financial instability, and difficulties in allocating risks appropriately between public and private stakeholders. While some transportation PPP projects have demonstrated substantial cost savings and operational improvements, others have experienced cost overruns, revenue shortfalls, contract renegotiations, and governance failures. These mixed outcomes indicate that PPPs are not a universal solution and that their effectiveness depends heavily on institutional quality, regulatory

frameworks, stakeholder coordination, and project-specific conditions (Devkar et al., 2020).

Recent literature suggests that the sustainability performance of PPP projects cannot be evaluated solely based on financial efficiency. Increasing attention has been directed toward environmental sustainability, social inclusion, accessibility, and long-term public value creation (Shen et al., 2016). Scholars argue that successful transportation PPPs should integrate sustainability considerations throughout the project lifecycle, including planning, procurement, implementation, operation, and performance evaluation. Factors such as environmental impact reduction, community participation, social equity, accessibility for vulnerable groups, and carbon emission mitigation have become important indicators for assessing the effectiveness of PPP-based transportation projects (Huang et al., 2018).

The growing body of research on PPPs and sustainable transportation reflects increasing academic and practical interest in understanding how collaborative governance arrangements can contribute to sustainable urban mobility (Dowling et al., 2015). Existing studies have examined various dimensions of PPP implementation, including financing mechanisms, governance structures, risk management strategies, institutional frameworks, and sustainability outcomes. However, the findings remain fragmented across different geographical contexts, transportation modes, and methodological approaches. Some studies emphasize the economic advantages of PPPs, while others focus on governance challenges, sustainability indicators, or stakeholder relationships. As a result, there is a need for a comprehensive review that synthesizes existing knowledge and identifies key themes, trends, opportunities, and challenges within this research field (Mohammed et al., 2016).

A literature review is particularly relevant because it provides a systematic understanding of how PPPs contribute to the development of sustainable public transportation systems across different contexts (Canitez, 2019). By consolidating evidence from previous studies, a literature review can identify recurring success factors, common implementation barriers, and emerging research directions. Such an analysis can also offer valuable insights for policymakers, transportation authorities, private investors, and researchers seeking to improve the effectiveness and sustainability of future transportation projects. Furthermore, understanding the relationship between PPP arrangements and sustainable transportation outcomes is increasingly important as governments continue to pursue climate goals, urban sustainability agendas, and infrastructure modernization initiatives (Anwar et al., 2017).

This study aims to conduct a comprehensive literature review on the role of Public-Private Partnerships in the development of sustainable public transportation systems (Marx, 2019). The review seeks to examine the evolution of scholarly research in this area, analyze the benefits and challenges associated with PPP implementation, identify critical success factors, and evaluate the contribution of PPPs to economic, social, and environmental sustainability objectives. By synthesizing existing literature, this study is expected to provide a clearer understanding of the potential and limitations of PPPs as a strategy for achieving sustainable public transportation development in contemporary urban environments (Xiong et al., 2019).

Method

Research Design

This study employs a Systematic Literature Review (SLR) as the primary research method to examine the role of Public–Private Partnerships (PPPs) in the development of sustainable public transportation systems. A Systematic Literature Review is a structured and comprehensive approach used to identify, evaluate, and synthesize existing research findings on a specific topic. Unlike traditional literature reviews, SLR follows a transparent and replicable process that minimizes bias and enhances the reliability of the findings. The adoption of this method is appropriate because the study aims to consolidate existing knowledge, identify research trends, explore key challenges and opportunities, and develop a comprehensive understanding of PPP implementation in sustainable public transportation projects.

Review Protocol

The review process follows the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) guidelines. PRISMA is widely recognized as a standardized framework for conducting systematic reviews and ensures transparency throughout the research process. The framework consists of four sequential stages: identification, screening, eligibility assessment, and final inclusion of studies. By applying the PRISMA protocol, this study systematically documents the procedures used to locate, evaluate, and select relevant literature. The protocol enhances the credibility of the review and facilitates future replication by other researchers interested in similar topics.

Data Sources

The literature reviewed in this study is collected from reputable academic databases that provide high-quality scholarly publications. These databases include Scopus, Web of Science, ScienceDirect, SpringerLink, and Google Scholar. The selection of multiple databases is intended to maximize the coverage of relevant studies and reduce publication bias. These databases contain peer-reviewed articles that discuss transportation infrastructure, sustainability, urban mobility, and public–private partnership arrangements. The use of reliable academic sources ensures that the evidence synthesized in this review is both credible and academically rigorous.

Search Strategy

A systematic search strategy is employed to identify relevant publications related to the research topic. The search process utilizes a combination of keywords associated with Public–Private Partnerships and sustainable public transportation. The primary keywords include “Public–Private Partnership,” “PPP,” “Sustainable Public Transportation,” “Sustainable Transport,” “Urban Mobility,” “Public Transit,” and “Transportation Infrastructure.” To improve the precision of the search results, Boolean operators such as AND and OR are applied. Examples of search strings include “Public–Private Partnership AND Sustainable Public Transportation,” “PPP AND Urban Transit,” and “Sustainable Transport Infrastructure AND Private Sector Participation.” The search is limited to publications written in English and published between 2015 and 2025 to ensure the inclusion of contemporary studies reflecting current developments in transportation sustainability and infrastructure governance.

Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria

To maintain the quality and relevance of the review, clear inclusion and exclusion criteria are established prior to the screening process. Studies are included if they are peer-reviewed journal articles, written in English, published within the selected time frame, and specifically address the implementation of Public–Private Partnerships in public transportation or transportation infrastructure projects. Furthermore, the selected studies must discuss sustainability-related outcomes, including economic efficiency, environmental performance, social impacts, or governance aspects.

Conversely, studies are excluded if they are conference abstracts, editorials, commentaries, book reviews, theses, dissertations, or non-peer-reviewed publications. Articles that focus on PPP applications outside the transportation sector or fail to discuss sustainability dimensions are also excluded. Duplicate publications retrieved from multiple databases are removed during the initial screening stage to ensure that each study is represented only once in the review.

Study Selection Process

The study selection process is conducted according to the stages outlined in the PRISMA framework. During the identification stage, all records obtained from the selected databases are compiled and imported into reference management software. Duplicate records are then identified and removed. In the screening stage, titles and abstracts are reviewed to assess their relevance to the research objectives. Studies that appear relevant proceed to the eligibility stage, where full-text articles are examined in greater detail. Only articles that fully satisfy the inclusion criteria are retained for the final analysis. The entire process is documented through a PRISMA flow diagram that illustrates the number of studies identified, screened, excluded, and ultimately included in the review.

Data Extraction Procedure

Following the selection of eligible studies, a systematic data extraction procedure is conducted. Relevant information from each article is recorded using a standardized extraction form. The extracted data include author names, publication year, country of study, research objectives, methodological approach, transportation mode or infrastructure examined, PPP model employed, sustainability dimensions addressed, key findings, implementation challenges, and recommendations. This structured approach facilitates comparison among studies and supports the development of a coherent synthesis of the literature.

Data Analysis Technique

The collected data are analyzed using thematic analysis. Thematic analysis is a qualitative analytical technique that identifies, organizes, and interprets recurring patterns within a body of literature. Initially, all selected studies are reviewed thoroughly to gain familiarity with the content. Subsequently, significant findings are coded and grouped into broader thematic categories. The themes are expected to include financing mechanisms, infrastructure development, operational efficiency, service quality improvement, environmental sustainability, social inclusion, risk allocation, governance challenges, and critical success factors for PPP implementation. Through thematic analysis, the study synthesizes diverse findings into a coherent framework that explains how PPPs contribute to the development of sustainable public transportation systems.

Quality Assessment

To ensure the reliability and validity of the review findings, the selected studies undergo a quality assessment process. Each article is evaluated based on its methodological rigor, relevance to the research objectives, clarity of findings, and contribution to the understanding of PPP implementation in sustainable transportation. Studies with insufficient methodological information or limited relevance to the research questions are scrutinized before inclusion. This assessment process enhances the overall quality of the evidence synthesized in the review and strengthens the credibility of the study's conclusions.

Results

Description of Selected Literature

The literature selection process resulted in a final set of studies that met the predetermined inclusion and exclusion criteria. These studies were obtained from reputable academic databases, including Scopus, Web of Science, ScienceDirect, SpringerLink, and Google Scholar. The selected articles were published between 2015 and 2025 and primarily focused on the implementation of Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs) in the development, financing, operation, and management of sustainable public transportation systems. The reviewed studies covered various transportation modes, including metro rail systems, bus rapid transit (BRT), light rail transit (LRT), urban railway networks, and integrated public transport systems.

A review of the selected literature indicates that research on PPPs in sustainable transportation has increased significantly over the last decade. This trend reflects growing interest among scholars and policymakers in identifying innovative financing and governance mechanisms capable of addressing transportation infrastructure deficits while supporting sustainability objectives. Most of the studies emphasized the role of PPPs in mobilizing private investment, improving operational efficiency, and accelerating infrastructure delivery.

Several studies highlighted the importance of risk-sharing arrangements between public and private partners. According to one study,

"Effective risk allocation is one of the most critical determinants of PPP project success".

Similarly, another study argued that

"The transfer of specific project risks to the party best able to manage them improves project performance and long-term sustainability"

These findings suggest that well-designed contractual frameworks play a crucial role in achieving desired transportation outcomes.

The reviewed literature also emphasized the contribution of PPPs to environmental sustainability. Many authors reported that PPP-based transportation projects facilitate the adoption of innovative technologies, energy-efficient systems, and environmentally friendly transportation solutions. One study noted that

"PPP arrangements can accelerate the implementation of green transport infrastructure and contribute to reducing carbon emissions in urban areas"

Such findings demonstrate the potential of PPPs to support broader sustainability goals beyond financial performance.

Despite these advantages, several studies identified challenges associated with PPP implementation. Common issues included regulatory uncertainty, political instability, financing constraints, and stakeholder conflicts. As stated by one author,

“Institutional weaknesses and inconsistent policy frameworks often undermine the effectiveness of PPP projects”

Another study observed that

“The complexity of long-term concession agreements may create governance challenges and increase transaction costs”

These findings indicate that the success of PPP projects depends not only on financial arrangements but also on strong institutional and regulatory environments.

The selected literature provides comprehensive evidence that PPPs can contribute significantly to the development of sustainable public transportation systems when supported by effective governance structures, appropriate risk-sharing mechanisms, and clear sustainability objectives. The reviewed studies collectively suggest that PPPs offer opportunities to enhance infrastructure quality, improve service delivery, and promote sustainable urban mobility, although several implementation challenges remain.

Trends of Research on Public–Private Partnerships in Sustainable Transportation

Research on Public–Private Partnerships (PPPs) in sustainable transportation has experienced significant growth over the past decade. This increasing attention is closely associated with the growing need for sustainable mobility solutions, rapid urbanization, environmental concerns, and the limitations of public funding for transportation infrastructure. Governments worldwide have increasingly turned to PPP arrangements as an alternative mechanism for financing, constructing, operating, and maintaining transportation systems capable of supporting sustainable urban development. Consequently, scholars have shown growing interest in examining the effectiveness of PPPs in addressing economic, environmental, and social sustainability challenges within the transportation sector.

A review of the selected literature reveals that early studies primarily focused on the financial and economic dimensions of PPP projects. Researchers examined topics such as infrastructure financing, risk allocation, project efficiency, and value for money. Many studies investigated whether private sector participation could improve project delivery and reduce the financial burden on governments.

“PPP models provide an effective mechanism for mobilizing private capital and enhancing infrastructure investment efficiency.”

This perspective reflects the dominant focus of earlier research, which viewed PPPs mainly as instruments for infrastructure financing and economic development.

More recent studies have expanded beyond purely financial considerations and increasingly emphasize sustainability outcomes. Researchers now examine how PPPs contribute to reducing greenhouse gas emissions, improving energy efficiency, promoting low-carbon transportation systems, and enhancing urban resilience.

Sustainable transportation is no longer evaluated solely in terms of operational performance but also in relation to environmental and social impacts.

“the integration of sustainability objectives into PPP transportation projects has become essential for achieving long-term public value.”

This shift demonstrates a growing recognition that transportation infrastructure must support broader sustainability goals rather than merely address mobility needs.

Another notable trend is the increasing focus on governance and institutional factors influencing PPP performance. Several studies have highlighted the importance of regulatory frameworks, stakeholder collaboration, transparency, and accountability in determining project success. Researchers have found that strong institutional environments contribute significantly to effective PPP implementation.

“Institutional quality and governance capacity are among the most important determinants of successful PPP outcomes.”

This finding suggests that sustainable transportation development requires not only financial resources but also robust governance mechanisms capable of managing long-term partnerships.

Digitalization and technological innovation have also emerged as important themes within the literature. Recent studies increasingly explore the role of PPPs in supporting smart transportation systems, intelligent traffic management, integrated ticketing platforms, and data-driven mobility services. Advances in digital technologies have created opportunities for public and private stakeholders to collaborate in delivering more efficient and sustainable transportation solutions. Researchers argue that the integration of smart technologies can enhance service quality, improve operational efficiency, and contribute to environmental sustainability.

In addition, there has been a growing interest in comparative and cross-country studies. Scholars increasingly investigate PPP experiences across different regions to identify best practices and lessons learned. These studies often compare institutional frameworks, financing mechanisms, risk-sharing arrangements, and sustainability outcomes among developed and developing countries. Such comparative analyses provide valuable insights into the contextual factors that influence PPP performance and help policymakers adapt successful strategies to local conditions.

The literature indicates a clear evolution in PPP research within the sustainable transportation sector. While earlier studies concentrated primarily on financing and infrastructure delivery, contemporary research adopts a more comprehensive perspective that incorporates environmental sustainability, social inclusion, governance quality, and technological innovation. This trend reflects the growing understanding that successful transportation PPPs must generate not only economic benefits but also long-term environmental and societal value.

The Role of Public–Private Partnerships in the Development of Sustainable Public Transportation Systems

Public–Private Partnerships (PPPs) play a significant role in supporting the development of sustainable public transportation systems by combining the resources, expertise, and capabilities of both the public and private sectors. The increasing complexity of transportation infrastructure projects, coupled with growing financial constraints faced

by governments, has made PPPs an important mechanism for delivering efficient, innovative, and sustainable transportation services. Through collaborative arrangements, governments are able to leverage private-sector investment, technical knowledge, and managerial expertise while maintaining public oversight and accountability.

One of the most important roles of PPPs is facilitating infrastructure financing. Sustainable public transportation projects such as metro systems, bus rapid transit (BRT), light rail transit (LRT), and urban railway networks often require substantial capital investments that exceed the financial capacity of governments alone. PPP arrangements enable governments to access private financing and distribute project risks more effectively. According to several studies,

“PPP models provide alternative financing mechanisms that accelerate the development of transportation infrastructure while reducing immediate fiscal pressures on governments”

This demonstrates how PPPs can help bridge infrastructure financing gaps and support long-term transportation development goals.

In addition to financing, PPPs contribute significantly to improving operational efficiency and service quality. Private-sector participation often introduces modern management practices, advanced technologies, and performance-based operational systems that enhance transportation services. Several studies have reported that PPP-operated transportation systems frequently achieve higher levels of efficiency, reliability, and customer satisfaction compared to traditionally managed public systems. As noted in one study,

“Private sector involvement can improve service delivery through innovation, efficiency gains, and effective performance management”

These improvements contribute directly to the sustainability of transportation systems by encouraging greater public transport usage and reducing dependence on private vehicles.

Another important role of PPPs is promoting environmental sustainability. Many contemporary transportation PPP projects incorporate green technologies, energy-efficient infrastructure, and environmentally responsible operational practices. Through private-sector innovation and investment, transportation systems can adopt cleaner technologies that reduce greenhouse gas emissions and improve urban environmental quality. Research has shown that

“PPP arrangements facilitate the implementation of sustainable transport solutions that support low-carbon urban development”

This contribution aligns with global sustainability objectives, including climate change mitigation and the promotion of environmentally friendly mobility systems.

PPPs also play a crucial role in supporting technological innovation within the transportation sector. Advances in intelligent transportation systems, digital ticketing platforms, real-time passenger information systems, and smart mobility solutions have increasingly been integrated into PPP transportation projects. Private-sector partners often possess the technical expertise and innovation capabilities necessary to develop and implement these technologies efficiently. Consequently, PPPs contribute to

modernizing transportation infrastructure and improving the overall user experience while enhancing system performance and sustainability.

Furthermore, PPPs facilitate risk sharing between public and private stakeholders. Transportation projects are often associated with financial, operational, technical, and political risks. Through carefully designed contractual arrangements, these risks can be allocated to the parties best equipped to manage them. Effective risk-sharing mechanisms improve project outcomes and increase the likelihood of long-term success. According to the reviewed literature,

“Appropriate risk allocation remains one of the most critical success factors in transportation PPP projects”

This finding highlights the importance of balanced partnerships in achieving sustainable infrastructure development.

Despite their numerous benefits, the literature also emphasizes that the effectiveness of PPPs depends on strong governance frameworks, transparent procurement processes, regulatory stability, and stakeholder collaboration. Without these supporting conditions, PPP projects may face implementation challenges that undermine their intended benefits. Therefore, successful PPPs require not only financial investment but also institutional capacity, policy consistency, and long-term commitment from both public and private partners.

The reviewed literature indicates that PPPs serve as a strategic instrument for developing sustainable public transportation systems. Their contributions extend beyond infrastructure financing to include operational efficiency, technological innovation, environmental sustainability, service quality enhancement, and risk management. When supported by effective governance and appropriate regulatory frameworks, PPPs can significantly contribute to the achievement of sustainable urban mobility objectives and long-term transportation resilience.

Benefits of Public–Private Partnership (PPP) Implementation

The implementation of Public–Private Partnerships (PPPs) has generated significant benefits in the development and management of sustainable public transportation systems. As governments face increasing pressure to expand transportation infrastructure while operating under limited financial resources, PPPs have emerged as an effective mechanism for combining public objectives with private-sector capabilities. The literature consistently highlights that PPPs provide economic, operational, technological, environmental, and social advantages that contribute to the long-term sustainability of transportation systems.

One of the most frequently reported benefits of PPP implementation is improved access to financial resources. Transportation infrastructure projects often require substantial capital investments that exceed the budgetary capacity of public authorities. Through PPP arrangements, governments can attract private investment and distribute project costs over an extended period. This financing mechanism enables the timely development of large-scale transportation projects without placing excessive pressure on public finances. According to one study,

“PPP schemes allow governments to accelerate infrastructure development by leveraging private capital while preserving public budget flexibility”

As a result, critical transportation projects can be implemented more rapidly than through conventional public procurement approaches.

Another major benefit of PPP implementation is enhanced operational efficiency. Private-sector organizations are often characterized by stronger managerial capabilities, performance-oriented practices, and greater flexibility in resource allocation. Their involvement in transportation projects can improve service quality, reduce operational costs, and increase overall system productivity. Several studies have found that PPP projects tend to achieve higher levels of efficiency due to clearly defined performance indicators and contractual obligations. As noted in the literature,

“Private participation introduces managerial innovation and operational discipline that can significantly improve project outcomes”

These efficiency gains contribute to better service delivery and increased user satisfaction.

Technological innovation is also widely recognized as a key advantage of PPP implementation. Private-sector partners frequently possess advanced technical expertise and access to innovative technologies that may not be readily available within public institutions. Consequently, PPP projects often facilitate the adoption of intelligent transportation systems, digital ticketing platforms, automated operations, and real-time passenger information services. These technological advancements improve the reliability, accessibility, and attractiveness of public transportation systems. One study emphasized that

“PPPs create opportunities for integrating innovative technologies that enhance both operational performance and customer experience”

From an environmental perspective, PPPs can support the transition toward more sustainable transportation systems. Many PPP transportation projects incorporate environmentally friendly technologies, energy-efficient infrastructure, and low-emission mobility solutions. Through investments in green transportation initiatives, PPPs contribute to reducing greenhouse gas emissions, improving air quality, and supporting climate change mitigation efforts. According to a study on sustainable transportation development,

“PPP arrangements can facilitate the deployment of environmentally sustainable transport solutions that contribute to urban sustainability goals”

This demonstrates the potential of PPPs to generate environmental benefits alongside economic returns.

The literature also identifies risk sharing as a significant benefit of PPP implementation. Infrastructure projects are often associated with various risks, including construction delays, cost overruns, demand uncertainty, and operational challenges. PPP contracts allow these risks to be allocated to the party most capable of managing them effectively. This approach improves project resilience and reduces the likelihood of financial losses for governments. As highlighted in one study,

“Effective risk allocation remains one of the primary advantages of PPP arrangements in infrastructure development”

Proper risk-sharing mechanisms therefore enhance project stability and long-term sustainability.

Furthermore, PPPs contribute to improved service quality and customer satisfaction. The performance-based nature of many PPP contracts encourages private operators to maintain high service standards to meet contractual obligations and achieve financial objectives. This often results in more reliable transportation services, better maintenance practices, increased safety standards, and improved passenger experiences. Enhanced service quality can encourage greater public transportation usage, thereby reduce traffic congestion and supporting sustainable urban mobility.

In addition, PPP implementation can stimulate economic growth and employment opportunities. Transportation infrastructure projects generate direct and indirect economic benefits through job creation, increased business activity, and improved connectivity between urban and regional areas. Better transportation networks facilitate the movement of people and goods, enhance productivity, and attract further investment. Consequently, PPP projects can contribute to broader socioeconomic development objectives while supporting sustainable transportation outcomes.

The literature suggests that PPP implementation offers multiple benefits that extend beyond infrastructure financing. These benefits include improved operational efficiency, technological innovation, environmental sustainability, effective risk management, enhanced service quality, and positive economic impacts. When supported by strong governance frameworks and appropriate regulatory mechanisms, PPPs can serve as an effective strategy for developing sustainable public transportation systems capable of meeting the mobility needs of growing urban populations while advancing long-term sustainability goals.

Challenges in the Implementation of Public–Private Partnerships (PPPs)

Despite the numerous benefits associated with Public–Private Partnerships (PPPs), the implementation of PPP projects in sustainable public transportation systems is often accompanied by various challenges. The literature indicates that while PPPs can enhance infrastructure financing, operational efficiency, and service quality, their success largely depends on the ability of public and private stakeholders to effectively address financial, institutional, regulatory, and operational obstacles. Failure to manage these challenges may result in project delays, cost overruns, contract disputes, and unsatisfactory outcomes.

One of the most frequently cited challenges is the complexity of risk allocation. PPP projects typically involve multiple stakeholders with different objectives, expectations, and levels of responsibility. Determining how risks should be distributed between public and private partners can be difficult, particularly when projects involve long-term investments and uncertain future conditions. According to one study,

“Inappropriate risk allocation remains one of the leading causes of PPP project underperformance”

If risks are transferred excessively to either party, project implementation may become inefficient and financially unsustainable. Therefore, achieving a balanced allocation of risks is essential for ensuring project success.

Financial uncertainty represents another major challenge in PPP implementation. Transportation projects often require significant capital investments and depend heavily on future revenue streams. Demand fluctuations, economic instability, inflation, and changes in market conditions can affect project profitability and financial viability. Several studies have reported that revenue forecasts are frequently overestimated during the planning phase, leading to financial difficulties once projects become operational. As noted in the literature,

“Demand forecasting errors and revenue uncertainty can significantly undermine the long-term viability of transportation PPP projects”

Such financial risks may discourage private-sector participation and increase the likelihood of contract renegotiation.

Regulatory and legal challenges also play a critical role in determining PPP performance. Effective PPP implementation requires a stable legal framework, transparent procurement procedures, and clear regulatory guidelines. However, many countries experience policy inconsistencies, bureaucratic inefficiencies, and regulatory uncertainties that create barriers to successful project execution. One study emphasized that

“Unclear legal frameworks and weak institutional structures often increase transaction costs and discourage private investment”

Frequent changes in government policies may further complicate project implementation and reduce investor confidence.

Governance and institutional capacity constitute another significant challenge identified in the literature. PPP projects require strong coordination among government agencies, private investors, financial institutions, and community stakeholders. Inadequate administrative capacity limited technical expertise, and weak governance structures can hinder project planning, monitoring, and evaluation. According to several researchers,

“Institutional weaknesses remain one of the most significant barriers to effective PPP implementation in developing economies”

Without sufficient institutional support, transportation PPP projects may encounter delays, inefficiencies, and governance-related conflicts.

Stakeholder management is also a recurring concern in PPP transportation projects. Public transportation systems directly affect communities, businesses, and local governments, making stakeholder engagement a critical component of project success. Conflicts may arise when stakeholders perceive that their interests are not adequately represented during project planning and implementation. Community opposition, concerns about fare increases, land acquisition disputes, and environmental impacts can create substantial obstacles. As highlighted by one study,

“Insufficient stakeholder engagement often results in public resistance and reduced project legitimacy”

Effective communication and participatory decision-making processes are therefore necessary to enhance public acceptance and project sustainability.

Another challenge concerns the long-term nature of PPP contracts. Transportation PPP agreements often extend for several decades, during which economic conditions,

technologies, political priorities, and social needs may change significantly. This creates uncertainty regarding contract performance and may necessitate renegotiation. While contract flexibility is important for adapting to changing circumstances, excessive renegotiation can increase costs and reduce transparency. Researchers have observed that

“long-term contractual complexity can create governance difficulties and increase the potential for disputes between project partners”

Consequently, contract design must balance stability with adaptability.

Environmental and sustainability considerations also present implementation challenges. Although PPP projects are increasingly expected to contribute to sustainability objectives, integrating environmental and social goals into project planning and evaluation remains difficult. In some cases, financial performance receives greater attention than environmental outcomes, leading to insufficient consideration of sustainability indicators. One study argued that

“The integration of sustainability objectives into PPP frameworks remains inconsistent across transportation projects”

This finding suggests the need for stronger sustainability requirements within PPP policies and contractual arrangements.

The literature demonstrates that PPP implementation in sustainable public transportation systems involves numerous challenges that extend beyond financing concerns. Risk allocation difficulties, financial uncertainty, regulatory instability, governance weaknesses, stakeholder conflicts, contractual complexity, and sustainability integration issues all influence project performance. Addressing these challenges requires strong institutional frameworks, transparent governance mechanisms, effective stakeholder engagement, and comprehensive risk management strategies. When these conditions are met, PPPs are more likely to achieve their intended objectives and contribute to the long-term sustainability of public transportation systems.

Success Factors of Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs)

The success of Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs) in the development of sustainable public transportation systems is influenced by a variety of interconnected factors. While PPPs offer significant opportunities for infrastructure financing, operational efficiency, and service improvement, their effectiveness depends largely on the presence of supportive institutional, financial, regulatory, and managerial conditions. The literature consistently emphasizes that successful PPP implementation requires more than simply establishing a contractual relationship between public and private entities. Instead, it involves a comprehensive framework that promotes collaboration, accountability, transparency, and long-term commitment among all stakeholders.

One of the most frequently identified success factors is the existence of a strong and stable regulatory framework. Clear legal provisions, transparent procurement procedures, and consistent government policies create a favorable environment for private-sector participation. A well-defined regulatory structure reduces uncertainty, increases investor confidence, and facilitates efficient project implementation.

“a stable legal and regulatory environment is a fundamental prerequisite for successful PPP development”

When governments establish clear rules and responsibilities, both public and private partners can operate with greater confidence and predictability throughout the project lifecycle.

Government commitment and political support are also essential for PPP success. Transportation infrastructure projects often require long-term investments and may span multiple political administrations. Therefore, sustained political commitment is necessary to ensure policy continuity and institutional stability. Several studies have found that strong governmental support facilitates decision-making processes, accelerates project approvals, and enhances stakeholder confidence.

“Government commitment remains one of the most critical determinants of PPP project success”

Without adequate political backing, projects may face delays, funding challenges, or policy reversals that undermine their effectiveness.

Effective risk allocation is another key factor contributing to successful PPP implementation. Transportation infrastructure projects involve various risks, including construction risks, operational risks, financial risks, and demand-related uncertainties. The literature suggests that risks should be allocated to the party best equipped to manage them. Balanced risk-sharing arrangements improve efficiency, reduce conflicts, and increase project sustainability. One study stated that

“The allocation of risks to the most capable party enhances project performance and minimizes implementation failures”

Consequently, carefully designed contractual agreements are necessary to establish equitable and efficient risk management mechanisms.

Financial viability is equally important in determining the success of PPP transportation projects. Sustainable financing structures, realistic revenue projections, and access to long-term funding sources contribute significantly to project performance. Private investors are more likely to participate in projects that demonstrate strong financial feasibility and predictable returns. Researchers have emphasized that

“Financial sustainability is a critical condition for attracting private investment and ensuring long-term project success”

Adequate financial planning therefore reduces investment risks and enhances project resilience in changing economic conditions.

Institutional capacity and governance quality are also widely recognized as essential success factors. Public institutions responsible for managing PPP projects must possess sufficient technical expertise, administrative capability, and monitoring capacity. Effective governance mechanisms ensure transparency, accountability, and efficient project oversight. Several studies have concluded that

“Institutional competence and governance effectiveness significantly influence PPP outcomes”

Strong institutions are better equipped to negotiate contracts, monitor performance, resolve disputes, and safeguard public interests throughout the project duration.

Stakeholder engagement is another important determinant of PPP success. Public transportation projects affect a wide range of stakeholders, including government agencies, private investors, local communities, transport users, and civil society organizations. Meaningful stakeholder participation enhances transparency, improves decision-making, and increases public acceptance of projects. According to one study,

“Early and continuous stakeholder engagement contributes significantly to the legitimacy and sustainability of PPP projects”

Effective communication and collaboration among stakeholders help minimize conflicts and ensure that project objectives align with community needs.

The literature also highlights innovation and technological capability as important contributors to successful PPP implementation. Private-sector partners often introduce advanced technologies, modern management systems, and innovative operational practices that improve transportation performance. Smart transportation systems, digital ticketing solutions, intelligent traffic management, and environmentally friendly technologies are examples of innovations frequently associated with successful PPP projects. Researchers argue that

“Technological innovation enhances operational efficiency and supports the achievement of sustainability objectives”

These innovations improve service quality while contributing to environmental and economic sustainability.

Finally, sustainability integration has emerged as a critical success factor in contemporary PPP projects. Modern transportation infrastructure is increasingly expected to generate environmental, social, and economic benefits simultaneously. Successful PPPs incorporate sustainability considerations into project planning, implementation, operation, and evaluation. This includes reducing carbon emissions, promoting accessibility, enhancing social inclusion, and supporting long-term urban development goals. One study observed that

“The integration of sustainability objectives into PPP frameworks is essential for creating long-term public value”

This perspective reflects the growing recognition that transportation infrastructure should contribute not only to mobility but also to broader sustainable development outcomes.

The reviewed literature demonstrates that the success of PPPs in sustainable public transportation systems depends on a combination of regulatory stability, government commitment, effective risk allocation, financial viability, institutional capacity, stakeholder engagement, technological innovation, and sustainability integration. These factors collectively create an enabling environment that supports successful project delivery and long-term operational performance. When appropriately managed, they increase the likelihood that PPP projects will achieve their intended objectives and contribute to sustainable urban mobility and infrastructure development.

Discussion

The primary objective of this study was to identify the role of Public–Private Partnerships (PPPs) in the development of sustainable public transportation systems. The findings

from the reviewed literature demonstrate that PPPs play a multifaceted role that extends beyond conventional infrastructure financing (Shen et al., 2016). While earlier studies predominantly framed PPPs as mechanisms for mobilizing private capital and reducing fiscal burdens on governments, contemporary research increasingly positions PPPs as governance instruments capable of facilitating economic, environmental, and social sustainability objectives simultaneously. This evolution reflects a broader transformation in infrastructure governance, where transportation systems are no longer evaluated solely on efficiency and financial performance but also on their contribution to sustainable development outcomes (Bhattacharya et al., 2015).

A critical insight emerging from the literature is that PPPs should not be understood merely as contractual arrangements between public and private actors (Mouraviev et al., 2016). Instead, they represent institutional mechanisms through which diverse stakeholders coordinate resources, expertise, and responsibilities to address complex urban mobility challenges. This finding aligns with collaborative governance theory, which argues that sustainable public value is generated through cross-sectoral cooperation rather than through isolated actions by either government or the private sector. Consequently, the effectiveness of PPPs depends not only on financial arrangements but also on the quality of relationships, trust, and coordination among participating actors (Warse net al., 2018).

The findings further reveal that PPPs contribute significantly to transportation sustainability through multiple pathways. Economically, PPPs enable governments to overcome infrastructure financing constraints and accelerate project implementation. Environmentally, they facilitate the adoption of innovative technologies, low-carbon transport solutions, and energy-efficient systems. Socially, PPPs have the potential to improve accessibility, mobility, and service quality for urban populations. These findings suggest that PPPs function as integrative governance mechanisms capable of simultaneously addressing the three pillars of sustainability (Esposito et al., 2020). However, the literature also indicates that achieving such integration remains challenging in practice. Many transportation PPP projects continue to prioritize financial performance over environmental and social outcomes, creating a gap between theoretical sustainability objectives and actual project implementation.

This discrepancy highlights an important theoretical implication. Existing PPP frameworks have traditionally been grounded in economic theories emphasizing efficiency, risk allocation, and value for money (Ameyaw et al., 2015). While these principles remain important, the findings suggest that such frameworks may be insufficient for evaluating contemporary transportation PPPs. Sustainable transportation requires a broader conceptual lens that incorporates environmental stewardship, social inclusion, and long-term public value creation. Therefore, future PPP research should move beyond narrow economic assessments and adopt more holistic evaluation frameworks capable of capturing multidimensional sustainability impacts. This shift would better reflect the evolving expectations placed upon transportation infrastructure in the context of climate change, urbanization, and sustainable development (Pandit et al., 2017).

Another important observation concerns the relationship between governance quality and PPP success. The reviewed studies consistently indicate that institutional capacity, regulatory stability, and stakeholder engagement are among the most influential

determinants of project outcomes. This finding suggests that PPP effectiveness is highly context dependent. The same contractual model may generate substantially different results depending on the institutional environment in which it is implemented (Sarhan et al., 2017). In countries with strong governance structures, PPPs often achieve higher levels of efficiency, accountability, and sustainability performance. Conversely, in contexts characterized by weak institutions, regulatory uncertainty, or political instability, PPP projects are more likely to encounter implementation difficulties. This observation challenges the assumption that PPPs represent universally applicable solutions and underscores the importance of contextual adaptation in partnership design (Dewulf et al., 2020).

The literature also reveals an emerging tension between commercial objectives and public interests within transportation PPPs. Private-sector actors are naturally motivated by profitability and investment returns, whereas public authorities are expected to prioritize accessibility, affordability, environmental protection, and social welfare. Although PPP contracts attempt to balance these interests, conflicts frequently arise during project implementation. This finding raises important questions regarding accountability and public value governance. Sustainable transportation systems require long-term societal benefits that may not always align with short-term commercial incentives. Consequently, governments must develop regulatory mechanisms capable of ensuring that private-sector participation contributes to broader public objectives rather than focusing exclusively on financial performance (Hodge et al., 2017).

From a policy perspective, the findings imply that governments should reconsider how transportation PPPs are designed and evaluated. Traditional procurement approaches often emphasize cost efficiency and project delivery timelines. However, the evidence reviewed in this study suggests that sustainability indicators should be integrated explicitly into PPP planning, procurement, and performance assessment processes. Environmental outcomes, social equity considerations, accessibility improvements, and carbon reduction targets should be treated as core performance criteria rather than secondary objectives (Hueskes et al., 2017). Such an approach would strengthen the alignment between PPP implementation and sustainable development goals.

Furthermore, the increasing integration of digital technologies into transportation systems creates new opportunities for PPP innovation. Smart mobility platforms, intelligent transportation systems, data-driven traffic management, and integrated ticketing technologies are transforming the nature of urban transportation (Suntaxi, 2020). The literature suggests that PPPs can serve as effective vehicles for accelerating technological innovation by leveraging private-sector expertise and investment capabilities. Nevertheless, this technological transformation also introduces new governance challenges related to data ownership, cybersecurity, privacy protection, and digital equity. Future PPP frameworks must therefore address these emerging concerns to ensure that technological advancement contributes to inclusive and sustainable mobility outcomes.

The findings suggest that the future of PPPs in sustainable public transportation lies in their ability to evolve from infrastructure delivery mechanisms into comprehensive governance frameworks for sustainable urban mobility. Their long-term success will depend not only on efficient financing structures but also on the extent to which they can balance economic efficiency, environmental sustainability, social equity, technological

innovation, and public accountability. Therefore, policymakers, practitioners, and researchers should adopt a more integrated perspective that recognizes PPPs as instruments for creating sustainable public value rather than merely tools for infrastructure procurement (Agarchand et al., 2017).

Conclusion

This study aimed to identify the role of Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs) in the development of sustainable public transportation systems through a systematic review of existing literature. The findings demonstrate that PPPs play a crucial role not only in mobilizing financial resources for transportation infrastructure development but also in enhancing operational efficiency, promoting technological innovation, improving service quality, and supporting environmental sustainability objectives. The review further reveals that the successful implementation of PPPs depends on several critical factors, including strong regulatory frameworks, effective risk allocation, institutional capacity, stakeholder engagement, and long-term government commitment. Despite their significant potential, PPPs also face various challenges such as financial uncertainty, governance complexities, regulatory instability, and conflicts between commercial interests and public objectives. Overall, the literature suggests that PPPs can serve as effective mechanisms for advancing sustainable public transportation systems when supported by appropriate governance structures and sustainability-oriented policies. Therefore, PPPs should be viewed not merely as infrastructure financing tools but as collaborative governance instruments capable of generating long-term economic, social, and environmental value for sustainable urban mobility development.

References

- Agarchand, N., & Laishram, B. (2017). Sustainable infrastructure development challenges through PPP procurement process: Indian perspective. *International Journal of Managing Projects in Business*, 10(3), 642-662. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJMPB-10-2016-0078>
- Ameyaw, C., Adjei-Kumi, T., & Owusu-Manu, D. G. (2015). Exploring value for money (VfM) assessment methods of public-private partnership projects in Ghana: a theoretical framework. *Journal of Financial Management of Property and Construction*, 20(3), 268-285. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JFMPC-01-2015-0003>
- Anwar, B., Xiao, Z., Akter, S., & Rehman, R. U. (2017). Sustainable urbanization and development goals strategy through public-private partnerships in a South-Asian metropolis. *Sustainability*, 9(11), 1940. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su9111940>
- Bhattacharya, A., Oppenheim, J., & Stern, N. (2015). Driving sustainable development through better infrastructure: Key elements of a transformation program. *Brookings Global Working Paper Series*.
- Canitez, F. (2019). Urban public transport systems from new institutional economics perspective: a literature review. *Transport Reviews*, 39(4), 511-530. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01441647.2018.1552631>
- Cruz, C. O., & da Cruz, N. F. (2017). Public-private partnership. *The governance of infrastructure*, 103-126.
- Devkar, G., Palliyaguru, R., & Oyegoke, A. S. (2020). The effects of institutional frameworks on implementation of PPP projects: a comparative perspective in Australia and

- India. *International Journal of Construction Management*, 20(6), 720-736.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/15623599.2020.1769255>
- Dewulf, G., & Garvin, M. J. (2020). Responsive governance in PPP projects to manage uncertainty. *Construction management and economics*, 38(4), 383-397.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/01446193.2019.1618478>
- Dowling, R., & Kent, J. (2015). Practice and public-private partnerships in sustainable transport governance: The case of car sharing in Sydney, Australia. *Transport policy*, 40, 58-64. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tranpol.2015.02.007>
- Esposito, P., & Dicorato, S. L. (2020). Sustainable development, governance and performance measurement in public private partnerships (PPPs): A methodological proposal. *Sustainability*, 12(14), 5696.
<https://doi.org/10.3390/su12145696>
- Goetz, A. R. (2019). Transport challenges in rapidly growing cities: is there a magic bullet?. *Transport Reviews*, 39(6), 701-705.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/01441647.2019.1654201>
- Gurara, D., Klyuev, V., Mwase, N., & Presbitero, A. F. (2018). Trends and challenges in infrastructure investment in developing countries. *International Development Policy/ Revue internationale de politique de développement*, (10.1).
<https://doi.org/10.4000/poldev.2802>
- Hodge, G. A., & Greve, C. (2017). On public-private partnership performance: A contemporary review. *Public works management & policy*, 22(1), 55-78.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/1087724X16657830>
- Huang, J., Liu, S., Plaza, A., & Zhou, W. (2018). Creating an enabling environment for public-private partnerships in waste-to-energy projects.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.22617/WPS189766-2>
- Hueskes, M., Verhoest, K., & Block, T. (2017). Governing public-private partnerships for sustainability: An analysis of procurement and governance practices of PPP infrastructure projects. *International journal of project management*, 35(6), 1184-1195.
- Marx, A. (2019). Public-private partnerships for sustainable development: Exploring their design and its impact on effectiveness. *Sustainability*, 11(4), 1087.
<https://doi.org/10.3390/su11041087>
- Mohammed, M. A., Moles, R. J., & Chen, T. F. (2016). Meta-synthesis of qualitative research: the challenges and opportunities. *International journal of clinical pharmacy*, 38(3), 695-704. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11096-016-0289-2>
- Mouraviev, N., & Kakabadse, N. K. (2016). Conceptualising public-private partnerships: A critical appraisal of approaches to meanings and forms. *Society and Business Review*, 11(2), 155-173. <https://doi.org/10.1108/SBR-04-2016-0024>
- Osei-Kyei, R., & Chan, A. P. (2016). Developing transport infrastructure in Sub-Saharan Africa through public-private partnerships: policy practice and implications. *Transport Reviews*, 36(2), 170-186.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/01441647.2015.1077288>

- Pandit, A., Minné, E. A., Li, F., Brown, H., Jeong, H., James, J. A. C., ... & Crittenden, J. C. (2017). Infrastructure ecology: an evolving paradigm for sustainable urban development. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 163, S19-S27.
- Pojani, D., & Stead, D. (2015). Sustainable urban transport in the developing world: beyond megacities. *Sustainability*, 7(6), 7784-7805. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su7067784>
- Sarhan, S., Pasquire, C., Manu, E., & King, A. (2017). Contractual governance as a source of institutionalised waste in construction: A review, implications, and road map for future research directions. *International Journal of Managing Projects in Business*, 10(3), 550-577. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJMPB-07-2016-0058>
- Shen, L., Tam, V. W., Gan, L., Ye, K., & Zhao, Z. (2016). Improving sustainability performance for public-private-partnership (PPP) projects. *Sustainability*, 8(3), 289. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su8030289>
- Shen, L., Tam, V. W., Gan, L., Ye, K., & Zhao, Z. (2016). Improving sustainability performance for public-private-partnership (PPP) projects. *Sustainability*, 8(3), 289. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su8030289>
- Suntaxi, P. F. (2020). A Data-driven strategy for the development of a smart intercity bus system in Ecuador.
- Trebilcock, M., & Rosenstock, M. (2015). Infrastructure public-private partnerships in the developing world: Lessons from recent experience. *The Journal of Development Studies*, 51(4), 335-354. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00220388.2014.959935>
- Välilä, T. (2020). An overview of economic theory and evidence of public-private partnerships in the procurement of (transport) infrastructure. *Utilities Policy*, 62, 100995.
- Warsen, R., Nederhand, J., Klijn, E. H., Grotenbreg, S., & Koppenjan, J. (2018). What makes public-private partnerships work? Survey research into the outcomes and the quality of cooperation in PPPs. *Public Management Review*, 20(8), 1165-1185. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14719037.2018.1428415>
- Xiong, W., Chen, B., Wang, H., & Zhu, D. (2019). Governing public-private partnerships: A systematic review of case study literature. *Australian journal of public administration*, 78(1), 95-112. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-8500.12343>
- Yuan, J., Li, W., Guo, J., Zhao, X., & Skibniewski, M. J. (2018). Social risk factors of transportation PPP projects in China: A sustainable development perspective. *International journal of environmental research and public health*, 15(7), 1323. <https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph15071323>
- Zapatrina, I. (2016). Sustainable development goals for developing economies and public-private partnership. *Eur. Procurement & Pub. Private Partnership L. Rev.*, 11, 39.