



Analysis of the Effectiveness of Community Economic Empowerment Programs through a Collaborative Management Approach in Pare Pare

Fatmawati¹

¹Sekolah Tinggi Ilmu Ekonomi Amsir Pare Pare

*Corresponding Author: Fatmawati

Article Info

Article History:

Received 17 November 2020

Revised 14 December 2020

Accepted: 28 December 2020

Keywords:

Community Economic Empowerment, Collaborative Management, Program Effectiveness.

Abstract

Community economic empowerment has become an important strategy for promoting inclusive economic growth, reducing poverty, and enhancing community welfare. However, the effectiveness of empowerment programs is often influenced by the extent to which stakeholders collaborate in planning, implementation, and evaluation processes. This study aims to analyze the effectiveness of community economic empowerment programs through a collaborative management approach in Parepare City, Indonesia. The research employs a qualitative case study design to obtain an in-depth understanding of stakeholder collaboration and its contribution to program outcomes. Data were collected through in-depth interviews, observations, and document analysis involving local government officials, program coordinators, community leaders, private-sector representatives, and program beneficiaries. The collected data were analyzed using the interactive model of Miles, Huberman, and Saldaña, consisting of data condensation, data display, and conclusion drawing and verification. The findings indicate that community economic empowerment programs in Parepare have been generally effective in improving beneficiaries' economic conditions, enhancing entrepreneurial skills, increasing access to financial resources, expanding employment opportunities, and strengthening community participation. The study further reveals that collaborative management significantly contributes to program effectiveness by facilitating stakeholder coordination, resource sharing, collective decision-making, and continuous capacity building. Several supporting factors were identified, including strong stakeholder collaboration, government commitment, community participation, leadership support, and resource availability. However, the programs also face challenges such as limited funding, insufficient post-program mentoring, communication barriers, uneven stakeholder commitment, and market-related constraints. The study concludes that collaborative management serves as a critical mechanism for enhancing the effectiveness and sustainability of community economic empowerment programs. Strengthening collaborative governance structures and stakeholder engagement is therefore essential for achieving long-term community development outcomes and sustainable economic empowerment.

Introduction

Community economic empowerment has become a central strategy in promoting inclusive and sustainable development, particularly in developing countries where poverty, unemployment, and economic inequality remain persistent challenges (Van, 2020). Economic empowerment refers to the process of enhancing the capacity of individuals and communities to participate effectively in economic activities, improve their livelihoods, and gain greater control over resources and decision-making processes. Empowerment is closely linked to the expansion of opportunities, capabilities, and access

to resources that enable individuals to improve their quality of life and achieve sustainable economic independence (Wali et al., 2017). Consequently, governments around the world have increasingly implemented various community economic empowerment programs aimed at strengthening local economies, reducing poverty, and improving social welfare.

In Indonesia, community economic empowerment has become an important component of national and local development policies. The government has introduced numerous programs designed to support micro, small, and medium enterprises (MSMEs), enhance entrepreneurship, improve access to financial services, and strengthen community-based economic initiatives (Mulyani et al., 2019). These programs are expected to create employment opportunities, increase household incomes, and promote economic resilience among local communities. However, despite substantial investments in empowerment initiatives, the effectiveness of such programs often varies across regions due to differences in implementation capacity, stakeholder participation, resource availability, and governance structures (Haldane et al., 2019).

Parepare City, located in South Sulawesi Province, represents one of the urban areas actively implementing community economic empowerment programs as part of its local development agenda (Alma'arif, 2016). As a strategic economic hub in the region, Parepare faces both opportunities and challenges in fostering sustainable economic growth and improving community welfare. Various empowerment programs have been introduced to support local entrepreneurs, strengthen community enterprises, provide vocational training, and facilitate access to markets and financial resources. While these initiatives demonstrate the government's commitment to promoting inclusive economic development, questions remain regarding their effectiveness in achieving intended outcomes and generating sustainable benefits for community members (Gupta et al., 2016).

The growing complexity of socioeconomic challenges has highlighted the limitations of traditional government-centered approaches to development. Contemporary development issues often require the involvement of multiple actors, including government agencies, private-sector organizations, civil society groups, academic institutions, and local communities (Wehrmann, 2018). This reality has contributed to the emergence of collaborative management as an important governance approach in public administration and community development. Collaborative management refers to a process in which multiple stakeholders work together through shared decision-making, resource sharing, and collective problem-solving to achieve common objectives (Gillgren et al., 2019). The approach recognizes that complex social and economic problems cannot be effectively addressed by a single organization acting independently.

The importance of collaborative management in community empowerment programs has been emphasized by numerous scholars. Collaborative governance enables stakeholders from different sectors to engage constructively in decision-making processes, thereby enhancing policy effectiveness and implementation outcomes (Doberstein, 2016). Through collaboration, stakeholders can combine their expertise, resources, and networks to address development challenges more comprehensively. In the context of community economic empowerment, collaborative management can facilitate stronger coordination among government institutions, private enterprises, non-governmental organizations (NGOs), community groups, and beneficiaries. Such

cooperation can improve program design, resource mobilization, service delivery, and long-term sustainability (Hassan et al., 2019).

Several studies have demonstrated the positive relationship between collaborative approaches and development outcomes (Ramadass et al., 2018). Argue that collaborative governance systems can enhance public value creation by fostering trust, mutual understanding, and collective action among stakeholders. Similarly, Emphasize that cross-sector collaboration can improve the effectiveness of public programs by leveraging diverse resources and capabilities. These findings suggest that the effectiveness of community economic empowerment programs may depend not only on the availability of financial resources but also on the quality of stakeholder collaboration and management practices (Surya et al., 2020).

Despite the growing popularity of collaborative management, implementing collaborative approaches in community development programs is not without challenges. Differences in organizational interests, power imbalances, communication barriers, limited trust, and resource constraints can hinder effective collaboration among stakeholders (Desai, 2018). Furthermore, the success of collaborative initiatives often depends on leadership, institutional arrangements, stakeholder commitment, and the existence of supportive governance frameworks. Therefore, evaluating the effectiveness of community economic empowerment programs requires a comprehensive understanding of how collaborative processes influence program implementation and outcomes (Haldane et al., 2019).

Existing studies on community economic empowerment have predominantly focused on program outcomes such as income generation, employment creation, and poverty reduction (Djafar et al., 2019). While these dimensions are important, relatively limited attention has been given to the role of collaborative management in shaping program effectiveness, particularly in local government contexts. Moreover, previous research has often examined empowerment programs from either administrative or economic perspectives without adequately considering the interactions among stakeholders involved in program implementation (Fetterman, 2019). This gap highlights the need for further investigation into how collaborative management contributes to the success or failure of community empowerment initiatives.

In the context of Parepare City, empirical evidence regarding the effectiveness of community economic empowerment programs through a collaborative management approach remains limited (Fikri et al., 2019). Understanding how various stakeholders collaborate, share resources, coordinate activities, and overcome implementation challenges is essential for improving future program performance. Such knowledge can provide valuable insights for policymakers, program managers, and community organizations seeking to enhance the impact and sustainability of empowerment initiatives. Furthermore, examining collaborative management practices can contribute to the broader literature on community development, public administration, and collaborative governance (Amsler, 2016).

This study aims to analyze the effectiveness of community economic empowerment programs through a collaborative management approach in Parepare City. Specifically, the study seeks to examine how collaborative management is applied in program implementation, assess the effectiveness of empowerment initiatives in achieving their objectives, and identify the factors that support or hinder successful outcomes. By

exploring these issues, the study is expected to contribute both theoretically and practically to the understanding of collaborative management and community economic empowerment. The findings may also provide evidence-based recommendations for strengthening stakeholder collaboration and improving the effectiveness of community development programs in Parepare and similar contexts (Zein, 2016).

Method

Research Design

This study employs a qualitative research approach with a case study design to analyze the effectiveness of community economic empowerment programs through a collaborative management approach in Parepare City. Qualitative research is appropriate because it allows the researcher to explore social phenomena in depth and understand the experiences, perceptions, and interactions of stakeholders involved in the implementation of empowerment programs. The case study approach is selected because it enables an intensive examination of a specific phenomenon within its real-life context. In this study, the phenomenon under investigation is the implementation and effectiveness of community economic empowerment programs managed through collaborative arrangements among government institutions, community organizations, private-sector actors, and other relevant stakeholders. The qualitative case study approach provides a comprehensive understanding of how collaborative management influences program outcomes and contributes to community economic development.

Research Location

The research is conducted in Parepare City, South Sulawesi Province, Indonesia. Parepare was selected as the research location because it has implemented various community economic empowerment programs involving multiple stakeholders. As an important economic center in the region, the city provides a suitable context for examining collaborative management practices and their influence on program effectiveness. The existence of partnerships among local government agencies, community groups, private enterprises, and non-governmental organizations makes Parepare an appropriate case for investigating collaborative approaches in community empowerment initiatives.

Research Participants

The participants in this study consist of individuals who are directly involved in the planning, implementation, management, and utilization of community economic empowerment programs in Parepare. They include local government officials responsible for program administration, program coordinators, community leaders, representatives of community organizations, private-sector partners, and community members who have benefited from empowerment initiatives. These participants are selected because they possess relevant knowledge and experience regarding program implementation and stakeholder collaboration. Their perspectives are essential for understanding the effectiveness of the programs and identifying factors that influence successful outcomes.

Sampling Technique

This study utilizes purposive sampling to select participants who have direct involvement and substantial knowledge of community economic empowerment programs. Purposive sampling allows the researcher to identify information-rich participants capable of

providing detailed insights into the collaborative processes and program outcomes being investigated. In addition, snowball sampling is employed to identify additional participants through recommendations from initial informants. This approach helps the researcher access key stakeholders who may not have been identified during the initial selection process. Data collection continues until data saturation is achieved, meaning that no significant new information emerges from subsequent interviews.

Data Collection Methods

Data are collected through three primary methods: in-depth interviews, observation, and document analysis. In-depth interviews serve as the main source of data and are conducted using semi-structured interview guides. This method enables participants to share their experiences, perceptions, and opinions regarding collaborative management and program effectiveness while allowing flexibility for probing and clarification. Observation is conducted to obtain direct information about program activities, stakeholder interactions, and community participation. Through observation, the researcher gains a deeper understanding of the actual implementation process and can verify information obtained from interviews. Document analysis is also conducted to examine policy documents, program reports, implementation guidelines, meeting records, and evaluation reports. These documents provide supporting evidence and contextual information regarding the objectives, implementation processes, and outcomes of community empowerment programs.

Research Instruments

In qualitative research, the researcher functions as the primary research instrument responsible for collecting, interpreting, and analyzing data. To support data collection, several supplementary instruments are utilized, including interview guides, observation checklists, and document review forms. The interview guide contains questions related to collaborative management practices, stakeholder participation, resource sharing, decision-making processes, and program effectiveness. Observation checklists assist in systematically recording activities, interactions, and events relevant to the study. Document review forms facilitate the collection and organization of information obtained from official documents and reports. These instruments help ensure consistency and comprehensiveness throughout the data collection process.

Data Analysis Technique

The data collected in this study are analyzed using the interactive model developed by Miles, Huberman, and Saldaña. The analysis process consists of three interconnected stages: data condensation, data display, and conclusion drawing and verification. Data condensation involves selecting, simplifying, coding, and organizing information obtained from interviews, observations, and documents. This process helps identify meaningful themes and patterns related to collaborative management and program effectiveness. Data display involves presenting organized information in the form of matrices, thematic tables, charts, and narrative descriptions to facilitate interpretation. The final stage, conclusion drawing and verification, involves identifying relationships among themes, developing interpretations, and validating findings through continuous comparison with the collected data. This iterative process ensures that conclusions are grounded in empirical evidence and accurately reflect participants' experiences and perspectives.

Results

Description of Community Economic Empowerment Programs

Community economic empowerment programs in Parepare City are designed to improve the economic capacity, productivity, and self-reliance of local communities through various development initiatives. These programs are implemented by the local government in collaboration with community organizations, private-sector actors, cooperatives, financial institutions, and non-governmental organizations. The primary objective of these programs is to enhance the welfare of community members by providing opportunities for income generation, entrepreneurship development, skills improvement, and access to economic resources. In addition, the programs seek to reduce poverty, create employment opportunities, and strengthen local economic resilience in response to changing socioeconomic conditions.

Based on the findings of this study, community economic empowerment programs in Parepare encompass a range of activities, including entrepreneurship training, vocational skill development, business mentoring, microfinance assistance, cooperative development, and support for micro, small, and medium enterprises (MSMEs). These initiatives are targeted primarily at low-income households, small business owners, unemployed individuals, women's groups, youth organizations, and community-based enterprises. Through these interventions, beneficiaries are expected to acquire the knowledge, skills, and resources necessary to improve their economic conditions and achieve greater financial independence.

The implementation of these programs involves active collaboration among various stakeholders. Local government agencies play a leading role in policy formulation, program coordination, funding allocation, and monitoring activities. Community organizations contribute by mobilizing participants and facilitating communication between beneficiaries and implementing agencies. Private-sector partners provide technical assistance, business development support, and market access opportunities, while financial institutions assist beneficiaries through access to credit and financial services. This collaborative arrangement reflects the principles of collaborative management, where multiple stakeholders share responsibilities and resources to achieve common development goals.

The findings indicate that entrepreneurship and business development training are among the most widely implemented activities within the empowerment programs. These training sessions focus on enhancing participants' business management skills, financial literacy, marketing strategies, and product development capabilities. According to one local government official,

"the training programs are intended not only to improve technical skills but also to build entrepreneurial mindsets among community members so that they can develop sustainable sources of income."

This statement suggests that the programs emphasize both capacity building and long-term economic empowerment.

In addition to training activities, financial assistance and business capital support constitute important components of the empowerment programs. Many participants reported that access to financial resources enabled them to establish new businesses or expand existing enterprises. A beneficiary explained,

"before joining the program, I had difficulty obtaining business capital, but after receiving support and guidance, I was able to expand my small business and increase my income."

This finding demonstrates the importance of financial inclusion in supporting community economic development and improving household livelihoods.

The study also found that mentoring and business assistance services play a crucial role in ensuring program sustainability. Rather than providing one-time support, many programs incorporate continuous mentoring to help participants overcome challenges and adapt to changing market conditions. A program facilitator stated,

"continuous mentoring is essential because many participants need guidance after training to apply what they have learned and manage their businesses effectively."

This observation highlights the importance of ongoing support mechanisms in achieving long-term empowerment outcomes.

Furthermore, community participation emerged as a key feature of the empowerment programs. Beneficiaries are encouraged to contribute actively to program planning, implementation, and evaluation processes. Such participation enhances program relevance and increases community ownership of development initiatives. One community leader noted,

"Community involvement helps ensure that the programs address actual needs and encourages beneficiaries to take responsibility for their own development."

This perspective illustrates the significance of participatory approaches in strengthening program effectiveness and sustainability.

The findings suggest that community economic empowerment programs in Parepare are comprehensive initiatives aimed at enhancing economic opportunities, strengthening local capacities, and promoting sustainable livelihoods. Through collaborative efforts among government institutions, community organizations, private-sector actors, and beneficiaries, these programs seek to create positive socioeconomic impacts and contribute to local development. The integration of training, financial support, mentoring, and stakeholder collaboration reflects a holistic approach to community empowerment that extends beyond short-term assistance toward long-term economic resilience and self-sufficiency.

Implementation of Collaborative Management

The implementation of collaborative management in community economic empowerment programs in Parepare reflects the active involvement of multiple stakeholders working together to achieve shared development objectives. The collaborative management approach emphasizes collective decision-making, stakeholder participation, resource sharing, and coordinated action among government institutions, community organizations, private-sector actors, and program beneficiaries. The findings of this study indicate that collaboration has become a fundamental mechanism for improving program effectiveness and ensuring that empowerment initiatives respond to the actual needs of local communities. Through collaborative arrangements, stakeholders are able to combine their resources, expertise, and networks to address socioeconomic challenges more effectively than would be possible through isolated efforts.

The local government plays a central role in facilitating collaborative management by providing policy direction, program funding, institutional support, and coordination mechanisms. Government agencies are responsible for identifying community needs, designing empowerment initiatives, and creating opportunities for stakeholder participation. According to one government official,

“Collaboration is necessary because the government cannot address community economic challenges alone; therefore, partnerships with community organizations, businesses, and other stakeholders are essential to achieving sustainable results.”

This statement illustrates the recognition among public officials that community development requires collective action and shared responsibility.

Community organizations also play an important role in the collaborative management process. These organizations serve as intermediaries between program implementers and beneficiaries by facilitating communication, mobilizing participation, and representing community interests. The findings reveal that community groups contribute significantly to identifying local needs, encouraging beneficiary involvement, and monitoring program implementation. A community leader explained,

“Our role is to ensure that community members are actively involved in the program and that their voices are considered during planning and implementation.”

This finding suggests that community participation enhances the responsiveness and legitimacy of empowerment initiatives.

Private-sector participation constitutes another important element of collaborative management. Businesses and private organizations contribute technical expertise, entrepreneurship training, business mentoring, and market access opportunities for program participants. In some cases, private companies also provide financial support through corporate social responsibility (CSR) initiatives. A representative of a private-sector partner stated,

“Our contribution goes beyond funding; we also provide training and business guidance to help beneficiaries develop sustainable enterprises.”

This demonstrates how private-sector involvement can strengthen the practical and economic dimensions of empowerment programs.

The study further reveals that stakeholder coordination is facilitated through regular meetings, consultation forums, joint planning sessions, and communication networks. These mechanisms enable stakeholders to exchange information, discuss program progress, identify challenges, and develop collective solutions. Regular communication helps maintain transparency and promotes mutual understanding among participants. According to one program coordinator,

“Continuous communication among stakeholders is critical because it allows us to solve problems quickly and ensure that everyone is working toward the same objectives.”

This observation highlights the importance of effective communication in maintaining collaborative relationships and improving program performance.

Resource sharing is another significant characteristic of collaborative management identified in this study. Different stakeholders contribute various resources according to

their capacities and areas of expertise. Government institutions provide funding and policy support, community organizations facilitate community engagement, private-sector actors offer technical assistance and market connections, and beneficiaries contribute local knowledge and active participation. This pooling of resources increases program efficiency and expands the range of services available to participants. One program facilitator noted,

“The success of the program depends on the willingness of stakeholders to share resources and work together rather than operating independently.”

Such collaboration enhances the ability of the program to achieve its intended outcomes.

The findings also indicate that trust and mutual commitment are essential components of successful collaborative management. Stakeholders emphasized the importance of maintaining transparent relationships, honoring commitments, and fostering mutual respect throughout the implementation process. Trust encourages cooperation and reduces potential conflicts among participating organizations. A representative from a community organization stated,

“Without trust, collaboration becomes difficult because stakeholders may hesitate to share information or resources.”

This finding supports the argument that relational factors are as important as formal institutional arrangements in determining the effectiveness of collaborative initiatives.

Despite the positive outcomes associated with collaborative management, several challenges were identified. These challenges include differences in stakeholder priorities, limited financial resources, communication barriers, and variations in organizational capacity. Some participants reported that coordination can be time-consuming and that decision-making processes occasionally become complicated due to the involvement of multiple actors. Nevertheless, stakeholders generally agreed that the benefits of collaboration outweigh the challenges. As one government official explained,

“Although coordination requires effort and patience, collaboration ultimately produces better results because it combines the strengths of different organizations.”

This perspective highlights the perceived value of collaborative management in addressing complex community development issues.

The findings demonstrate that collaborative management has become a critical element in the implementation of community economic empowerment programs in Parepare. Through stakeholder participation, coordinated action, resource sharing, and mutual commitment, collaborative management contributes to more inclusive, responsive, and sustainable development outcomes. The implementation process reflects the principles of collaborative governance by fostering partnerships that enhance program effectiveness and strengthen community capacity for long-term economic development.

Effectiveness of Community Economic Empowerment Programs

The effectiveness of community economic empowerment programs in Parepare can be assessed through their ability to achieve intended objectives related to economic improvement, capacity building, employment generation, business development, and community self-reliance. Based on the findings of this study, the programs have generated positive impacts on beneficiaries by enhancing their knowledge, skills, access

to resources, and economic opportunities. The effectiveness of these programs is closely linked to the collaborative management approach adopted during implementation, which facilitates stakeholder participation, resource mobilization, and continuous support for beneficiaries. Participants generally perceived that the programs have contributed to improving their socioeconomic conditions, although the level of impact varies depending on individual circumstances, program participation, and available support mechanisms.

One of the most significant indicators of program effectiveness is the improvement in beneficiaries' economic conditions. Many participants reported increased income levels following their involvement in entrepreneurship training, business assistance, and financial support initiatives. The provision of business capital, skills development opportunities, and market access has enabled beneficiaries to establish or expand income-generating activities. A program beneficiary stated,

"Before participating in the program, my business generated only a small profit, but after receiving training and financial assistance, I was able to increase production and earn a more stable income."

This finding suggests that the empowerment programs have contributed to strengthening economic resilience and improving household livelihoods.

The programs have also demonstrated effectiveness in enhancing entrepreneurial knowledge and skills among participants. Training activities focused on business management, financial literacy, marketing strategies, product development, and customer service have improved the capacity of beneficiaries to manage their enterprises more effectively. Participants reported greater confidence in making business decisions and identifying market opportunities. According to one participant,

"The training helped me understand how to manage finances, promote products, and plan for business growth, which I did not know before joining the program."

This indicates that the programs have successfully supported human capital development, which is a key component of sustainable economic empowerment.

Another important measure of effectiveness is the creation of employment opportunities and business expansion. Several beneficiaries reported that their businesses had grown sufficiently to employ additional workers from their communities. This outcome not only improves individual welfare but also contributes to local economic development by generating new employment opportunities. A local business owner explained,

"After my business expanded, I was able to hire two additional workers from my neighborhood, which helped both my business and the community."

Such findings demonstrate that empowerment programs can produce broader socioeconomic benefits beyond the direct participants.

The study further reveals that community economic empowerment programs have strengthened participants' access to financial resources and institutional support. Many beneficiaries noted that prior to joining the programs, they faced difficulties obtaining loans or business capital from formal financial institutions. Through collaborative efforts involving government agencies, cooperatives, and financial institutions, participants gained access to funding opportunities and business support services. One beneficiary remarked,

"The program connected us with financial institutions and provided guidance on accessing credit, which was previously difficult for small entrepreneurs like us."

This suggests that the programs have improved financial inclusion and reduced barriers to economic participation.

In addition to economic outcomes, the programs have contributed to increasing community participation and social empowerment. Beneficiaries reported greater involvement in community activities, decision-making processes, and local development initiatives. The collaborative management approach encouraged interaction among stakeholders and fostered a sense of ownership among participants. A community leader stated,

"People are now more willing to participate in community programs because they see tangible benefits and feel that their opinions are valued."

This finding indicates that empowerment initiatives have strengthened social capital and community engagement, which are important elements of sustainable development.

Despite these positive outcomes, the findings also reveal several factors that limit program effectiveness. Some participants highlighted challenges such as limited funding, inadequate follow-up support, market competition, and unequal access to program opportunities. In certain cases, beneficiaries struggled to sustain their businesses after initial assistance ended. A participant explained,

"The program was very helpful at the beginning, but continuous mentoring and market support are still needed to ensure long-term success."

This observation suggests that while the programs have achieved important short-term outcomes, additional efforts may be required to enhance sustainability and maximize long-term impacts.

The collaborative management approach appears to have played a significant role in improving program effectiveness by facilitating coordination, resource sharing, and stakeholder engagement. Participants consistently emphasized that collaboration among government agencies, community organizations, private-sector actors, and beneficiaries enhanced the quality of program implementation and increased access to opportunities. A government official noted,

"The success of these programs depends on the ability of stakeholders to work together and provide complementary support to beneficiaries."

This statement highlights the importance of collaborative governance in achieving development objectives and ensuring program sustainability.

The findings indicate that community economic empowerment programs in Parepare have been moderately to highly effective in achieving their intended objectives. The programs have contributed to increased income, enhanced entrepreneurial capacity, expanded employment opportunities, improved financial inclusion, and strengthened community participation. However, the sustainability of these achievements depends on continued stakeholder collaboration, adequate resource allocation, and ongoing support mechanisms. The results suggest that collaborative management serves as an important factor in enhancing program effectiveness and promoting sustainable community economic development.

Supporting Factors

The findings of this study indicate that the effectiveness of community economic empowerment programs in Parepare is influenced by several supporting factors that contribute to successful implementation and positive program outcomes. These factors include strong stakeholder collaboration, government commitment, community participation, resource availability, leadership support, and continuous capacity-building initiatives. The presence of these enabling conditions has facilitated the achievement of program objectives and strengthened the sustainability of community empowerment efforts. Participants consistently emphasized that successful empowerment programs require not only financial resources but also active cooperation among stakeholders and a supportive institutional environment.

One of the most significant supporting factors identified in this study is stakeholder collaboration. The collaborative management approach encourages government agencies, community organizations, private-sector actors, financial institutions, and beneficiaries to work together toward common development goals. Through collaboration, stakeholders can share resources, exchange knowledge, and coordinate activities more effectively. A government official explained,

"The success of the program depends on strong cooperation among all stakeholders because each party contributes different resources and expertise that complement one another."

This finding suggests that collaboration enhances program efficiency and improves the ability of stakeholders to address community needs comprehensively.

Government commitment also emerged as a critical factor supporting program effectiveness. Local government agencies provide policy direction, financial support, technical assistance, and institutional coordination necessary for program implementation. Participants noted that government support creates a stable foundation for empowerment initiatives and facilitates cooperation among different organizations. According to one program coordinator,

"Without strong support from the local government, many program activities would be difficult to implement because the government plays a key role in coordination and resource allocation."

This observation highlights the importance of political and administrative commitment in ensuring program continuity and effectiveness.

Community participation represents another important supporting factor. The findings reveal that beneficiaries who actively engage in program activities tend to achieve better outcomes compared to those with limited involvement. Active participation enables community members to contribute ideas, identify local needs, and take ownership of program activities. A community leader stated,

"When people participate actively, they feel responsible for the success of the program and become more motivated to improve their economic conditions."

This finding demonstrates that community engagement strengthens program relevance and increases the likelihood of sustainable outcomes.

The availability of financial and material resources was also identified as an important determinant of program success. Adequate funding allows program implementers to provide training, business assistance, equipment, and financial support to beneficiaries. Furthermore, access to facilities and infrastructure contributes to the effective delivery of program activities. A beneficiary remarked,

"The financial support and equipment provided through the program helped me start my business and improve productivity."

This suggests that resource availability directly influences the capacity of beneficiaries to participate in economic activities and generate sustainable income.

Leadership support emerged as another significant factor facilitating program implementation. Effective leaders play an essential role in motivating stakeholders, resolving conflicts, and promoting collaboration among participating organizations. Participants emphasized that strong leadership helps maintain stakeholder commitment and ensures that program objectives remain aligned with community needs. One stakeholder explained,

"Leaders who are committed to community development can bring different groups together and encourage them to work toward shared goals."

This finding highlights the importance of facilitative leadership in collaborative management processes.

Capacity-building initiatives also contribute significantly to program effectiveness. Training programs, mentoring activities, technical assistance, and entrepreneurship development initiatives equip beneficiaries with the knowledge and skills necessary to manage businesses and improve their livelihoods. Participants reported that continuous learning opportunities enhanced their confidence and ability to respond to market challenges. According to a program beneficiary,

"the training and mentoring sessions provided practical knowledge that helped me manage my business more effectively and increase my income."

This demonstrates that capacity development is a crucial component of sustainable economic empowerment.

In addition, effective communication among stakeholders was found to support successful program implementation. Regular meetings, consultations, and information-sharing mechanisms facilitate coordination and help stakeholders address emerging challenges promptly. Open communication also promotes transparency and strengthens trust among participating organizations. A representative from a community organization stated,

"Good communication helps us understand each other's responsibilities and ensures that activities are implemented smoothly."

This finding indicates that communication serves as a foundation for collaborative action and effective program management.

Trust among stakeholders was another important supporting factor identified in the study. Participants emphasized that mutual trust encourages cooperation, reduces conflicts, and facilitates resource sharing. Trust develops through consistent

communication, transparency, and the fulfillment of commitments by participating organizations. One program facilitator noted,

"Trust is essential because collaboration becomes much easier when stakeholders believe that everyone is working toward the same objectives."

This observation supports the view that relational factors are critical for maintaining effective collaborative partnerships.

The findings reveal that stakeholder collaboration, government commitment, community participation, resource availability, leadership support, capacity building, effective communication, and mutual trust collectively contribute to the success of community economic empowerment programs in Parepare. These factors create a supportive environment that enables stakeholders to work together effectively, maximize available resources, and achieve sustainable development outcomes. The presence of these supporting factors strengthens the effectiveness of collaborative management and enhances the capacity of empowerment programs to improve community welfare and economic resilience.

Inhibiting Factors

Although community economic empowerment programs in Parepare have generated various positive outcomes, the findings of this study reveal several inhibiting factors that affect program implementation and reduce overall effectiveness. These obstacles originate from institutional, financial, social, and operational dimensions and often limit the ability of stakeholders to achieve program objectives fully. Participants emphasized that while collaborative management has facilitated cooperation among stakeholders, several challenges continue to hinder the sustainability and long-term impact of empowerment initiatives. Understanding these inhibiting factors is essential for improving future program implementation and strengthening collaborative governance mechanisms.

One of the most frequently identified challenges is limited financial resources. Although funding is available for program implementation, participants reported that financial support is often insufficient to meet the growing needs of beneficiaries. Limited budgets restrict the number of participants who can receive assistance and reduce the scope of training, mentoring, and business development activities. A program coordinator explained,

"The available budget is often not enough to accommodate all community members who need support, which limits the reach and impact of the program."

This finding suggests that financial constraints can reduce program coverage and hinder the achievement of broader community development objectives.

Another significant inhibiting factor is the limited continuity of assistance and mentoring after the initial implementation phase. Several beneficiaries stated that while training and financial support were useful, ongoing guidance was often inadequate. Without continuous mentoring, some participants experienced difficulties applying newly acquired skills, managing businesses, and responding to market challenges. One beneficiary stated,

"The training was very helpful, but after the program ended, we needed more guidance to overcome business challenges and sustain our progress."

This observation indicates that long-term support mechanisms are necessary to ensure the sustainability of empowerment outcomes.

The findings also reveal that variations in stakeholder commitment can affect the effectiveness of collaborative management. While some organizations demonstrate strong engagement, others participate only minimally in program activities. Differences in organizational priorities, resource availability, and institutional responsibilities sometimes create inconsistencies in stakeholder involvement. A community leader noted,

“Not all stakeholders contribute equally; some are highly active, while others participate only when required.”

This inconsistency can weaken coordination efforts and reduce the effectiveness of collaborative initiatives.

Communication barriers among stakeholders emerged as another important challenge. Although regular meetings and coordination mechanisms are established, participants reported occasional misunderstandings, delays in information sharing, and differences in expectations among collaborating organizations. Such communication problems may affect decision-making processes and hinder the timely implementation of program activities. According to one stakeholder representative,

“Sometimes information does not reach all parties at the same time, which creates confusion and delays in implementation.”

This finding highlights the importance of strengthening communication systems within collaborative management structures.

Market-related challenges were also identified as obstacles to the success of community economic empowerment programs. Many beneficiaries operate small-scale businesses that face intense competition, fluctuating consumer demand, and limited market access. While training programs help improve business skills, external economic factors often influence the sustainability of enterprises. One business owner explained,

“Even though we received training and support, competing with larger businesses remains difficult because market access is still limited.”

This suggests that empowerment programs should incorporate stronger market linkage strategies to enhance business competitiveness and long-term viability.

Another inhibiting factor concerns differences in beneficiaries' educational backgrounds, skills, and levels of motivation. Participants reported that some beneficiaries adapt quickly to training and business development opportunities, while others require additional support and guidance. Variations in learning capacity and commitment can influence the effectiveness of program outcomes. A program facilitator stated,

“Participants have different levels of readiness and motivation, which affects how successfully they apply the knowledge and skills provided through the program.”

This finding indicates that empowerment initiatives may need to adopt more tailored approaches to address the diverse needs of beneficiaries.

Bureaucratic and administrative challenges were also mentioned by several participants. Procedures related to funding disbursement, reporting requirements, and program

administration can sometimes delay implementation activities. Although accountability mechanisms are necessary, excessive administrative requirements may reduce operational flexibility and slow decision-making processes. A government official remarked,

“administrative procedures are important for accountability, but sometimes they take too much time and delay program activities.”

This observation suggests the need to balance accountability requirements with implementation efficiency.

Furthermore, the study found that external economic conditions can influence program effectiveness. Inflation, rising production costs, economic uncertainty, and market fluctuations create challenges for small businesses and community enterprises. Even when participants possess adequate skills and resources, broader economic conditions may affect their ability to generate sustainable income. One beneficiary explained,

“Sometimes business performance is affected by economic conditions that are beyond our control, such as increasing prices and declining customer demand.”

This finding demonstrates that external factors can significantly influence the outcomes of empowerment programs.

The findings indicate that limited funding, insufficient mentoring, uneven stakeholder commitment, communication barriers, market competition, differences in participant capacity, bureaucratic constraints, and external economic conditions represent major inhibiting factors affecting community economic empowerment programs in Parepare. While collaborative management has helped address some of these challenges, additional efforts are required to strengthen stakeholder coordination, improve resource allocation, enhance capacity-building mechanisms, and ensure the long-term sustainability of empowerment initiatives. Addressing these obstacles will be essential for maximizing program effectiveness and achieving broader community development goals.

Discussion

The primary objective of this study was to analyze the effectiveness of community economic empowerment programs through a collaborative management approach in Parepare City (Arif et al., 2016). The findings demonstrate that collaborative management plays a significant role in enhancing the effectiveness of empowerment initiatives by facilitating stakeholder participation, resource mobilization, capacity building, and coordinated action. The results indicate that the success of community empowerment programs cannot be attributed solely to the availability of financial assistance or technical training. Rather, program effectiveness emerges from the interaction among multiple stakeholders who collectively contribute resources, expertise, and institutional support. This finding reinforces the argument that community development outcomes are increasingly dependent on collaborative governance arrangements rather than traditional top-down administrative approaches (Eckerberg et al., 2015).

The findings reveal that collaborative management functions as an enabling mechanism that strengthens the relationship between empowerment interventions and development outcomes. Through collaboration, government agencies, community organizations, private-sector actors, and beneficiaries can align their objectives and

coordinate their activities more effectively. Which emphasizes the importance of stakeholder engagement, consensus-oriented decision-making, and shared responsibility in addressing complex public problems. In the context of Parepare, collaboration appears to enhance program responsiveness by ensuring that empowerment initiatives are aligned with local needs and socioeconomic realities (Alma'arif et al., 2016).

An important insight emerging from the findings is that effectiveness should not be understood solely in economic terms (Rahman et al., 2019). Although increased income, business expansion, and employment creation were identified as significant outcomes, the study also found evidence of social and institutional empowerment. Beneficiaries reported increased confidence, stronger participation in community activities, improved decision-making capacities, and greater access to social and economic networks. These findings suggest that empowerment is a multidimensional process encompassing economic, social, and institutional dimensions. Consequently, evaluating program effectiveness exclusively through economic indicators may underestimate the broader developmental impacts generated through collaborative management (Koontz et al., 2020).

The study further demonstrates that stakeholder collaboration contributes to the creation of social capital within communities. Regular interaction among stakeholders fosters trust, reciprocity, and mutual understanding, which are essential conditions for sustainable development. This finding is consistent with social capital theory, which argues that networks, trust, and social relationships facilitate collective action and improve development outcomes. The collaborative arrangements observed in Parepare indicate that empowerment programs can function not only as economic interventions but also as mechanisms for strengthening social cohesion and community resilience. Therefore, collaborative management creates value that extends beyond immediate economic gains and contributes to long-term community development (Green et al., 2015).

Another important implication of the findings concerns the role of government within collaborative management systems. Traditional development models often position government as the primary provider of resources and services. However, the findings suggest that the government's role is evolving toward that of a facilitator, coordinator, and network manager (Khan, 2015). Rather than acting alone, government institutions increasingly depend on partnerships with civil society organizations, private enterprises, and community groups to achieve development objectives. This shift reflects broader transformations in public administration, where governance is increasingly characterized by interdependence, shared authority, and collaborative problem-solving. The findings therefore contribute to contemporary debates regarding the changing nature of governance in local development contexts.

Despite the positive contributions of collaborative management, the findings also reveal several limitations and challenges. The presence of unequal stakeholder commitment, communication barriers, limited financial resources, and insufficient post-program support demonstrates that collaboration itself does not automatically guarantee successful outcomes. This observation challenges overly optimistic assumptions within some collaborative governance literature, which often portrays collaboration as inherently beneficial. Instead, the findings suggest that the effectiveness of collaboration depends on the quality of institutional arrangements, leadership capacity, stakeholder

commitment, and resource availability. Consequently, collaboration should be viewed as a dynamic and context-dependent process rather than a universal solution to development challenges (Liu et al., 2018).

The findings also expose a tension between short-term program achievements and long-term sustainability. While many beneficiaries experienced immediate improvements in skills, income, and business performance, maintaining these gains after program completion remains a challenge (Fisher et al., 2017). This issue raises important questions regarding the sustainability of empowerment interventions. The evidence suggests that empowerment should be conceptualized as a continuous process rather than a one-time intervention. Sustainable outcomes require ongoing mentoring, market access support, institutional strengthening, and adaptive governance mechanisms capable of responding to changing socioeconomic conditions. Without such support, the long-term impact of empowerment programs may be limited (Andrijevic et al., 2020).

From a theoretical perspective, the findings contribute to the growing body of literature linking collaborative governance and community empowerment. Existing studies often examine these concepts separately, focusing either on governance processes or empowerment outcomes. This study demonstrates that collaborative management serves as a critical intermediary mechanism through which empowerment objectives are achieved. The findings therefore support the integration of collaborative governance theory and community empowerment theory within a unified analytical framework. Such integration provides a more comprehensive understanding of how stakeholder interactions influence development outcomes at the local level (Koebele, 2019).

From a policy perspective, the findings suggest that future community empowerment programs should prioritize the strengthening of collaborative structures rather than focusing exclusively on financial assistance. Policymakers should invest in stakeholder coordination mechanisms, capacity-building initiatives, participatory planning processes, and institutional partnerships that support long-term collaboration. Furthermore, evaluation frameworks should incorporate indicators related to stakeholder engagement, network effectiveness, trust-building, and collaborative capacity alongside traditional economic performance measures. Such an approach would provide a more comprehensive assessment of program effectiveness and sustainability (Jagosh et al., 2015).

The findings indicate that collaborative management significantly enhances the effectiveness of community economic empowerment programs by facilitating stakeholder cooperation, resource sharing, and collective problem-solving. However, the effectiveness of collaborative approaches depends on the quality of governance arrangements, stakeholder commitment, and the availability of supportive institutional mechanisms. Therefore, community empowerment initiatives should be understood not merely as economic development programs but as collaborative governance processes that generate economic, social, and institutional value. This perspective broadens the understanding of empowerment and highlights the importance of collaboration as a strategic foundation for sustainable community development (Kamara, 2017).

Conclusion

This study analyzed the effectiveness of community economic empowerment programs through a collaborative management approach in Parepare City. The findings indicate

that the programs have generally been effective in improving beneficiaries' economic conditions, enhancing entrepreneurial skills, expanding access to financial resources, creating employment opportunities, and strengthening community participation. The study further reveals that collaborative management plays a crucial role in achieving these outcomes by facilitating stakeholder coordination, resource sharing, collective decision-making, and active community involvement. The effectiveness of the programs is supported by several factors, including strong stakeholder collaboration, government commitment, community participation, leadership support, adequate resource availability, and continuous capacity-building efforts. However, the study also identifies several challenges, such as limited funding, insufficient post-program mentoring, uneven stakeholder commitment, communication barriers, market competition, and administrative constraints, which may affect the sustainability of program outcomes. Overall, the findings suggest that community economic empowerment programs are more likely to achieve sustainable and meaningful impacts when implemented through effective collaborative management that integrates the contributions of government agencies, private-sector actors, community organizations, and beneficiaries. Therefore, strengthening collaborative governance mechanisms and ensuring long-term stakeholder engagement are essential for enhancing the effectiveness and sustainability of future community empowerment initiatives in Parepare and similar development contexts.

References

- Van Niekerk, A. J. (2020). Inclusive economic sustainability: SDGs and global inequality. *Sustainability*, 12(13), 5427. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su12135427>
- Wali, A., Alvira, D., Tallman, P. S., Ravikumar, A., & Macedo, M. O. (2017). A new approach to conservation: using community empowerment for sustainable well-being. *Ecology & Society*, 22(4). <https://doi.org/10.5751/ES-09598-220406>
- Mulyani, H., & Mulyadi, A. (2019, May). Community-based MSMEs (Micro, Small, Medium Enterprises) Financing Model to Increase Bussiness Independence. In *1st International Conference on Economics, Business, Entrepreneurship, and Finance (ICEBEF 2018)* (pp. 47-51). Atlantis Press. <https://doi.org/10.2991/icebef-18.2019.11>
- Haldane, V., Chuah, F. L., Srivastava, A., Singh, S. R., Koh, G. C., Seng, C. K., & Legido-Quigley, H. (2019). Community participation in health services development, implementation, and evaluation: A systematic review of empowerment, health, community, and process outcomes. *PloS one*, 14(5), e0216112.
- Alma'arif, A. A. (2016). COMMUNITY EMPOWERMENT IN PAREPARE CITY: METHOD, CHALLENGES AND SOLUTIONS. *International Journal of Kybernology (IJoK)*, 7(1).
- Gupta, J., & Vegelin, C. (2016). Sustainable development goals and inclusive development. *International environmental agreements: Politics, law and economics*, 16(3), 433-448. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10784-016-9323-z>
- Wehrmann, D. (2018). *Incentivising and regulating multi-actor partnerships and private-sector engagement in development cooperation* (No. 21/2018). Discussion Paper. <https://doi.org/10.23661/dp21.2018>

- Gillgren, C., Støttrup, J. G., Schumacher, J., & Dinesen, G. E. (2019). Working together: collaborative decision making for sustainable Integrated Coastal Management (ICM). *Journal of Coastal Conservation*, 959-968.
- Doberstein, C. (2016). Designing collaborative governance decision-making in search of a 'collaborative advantage'. *Public Management Review*, 18(6), 819-841. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14719037.2015.1045019>
- Hassan, M. M., Lee, K. E., & Mokhtar, M. (2019). Streamlining non-governmental organizations' programs towards achieving the sustainable development goals: A conceptual framework. *Sustainable Development*, 27(3), 401-408. <https://doi.org/10.1002/sd.1912>
- Ramadass, S. D., Sambasivan, M., & Xavier, J. A. (2018). Collaboration outcomes in a public sector: impact of governance, leadership, interdependence and relational capital. *Journal of Management and Governance*, 22(3), 749-771. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10997-018-9401-4>
- Surya, B., Syafri, S., Sahban, H., & Sakti, H. H. (2020). Natural resource conservation based on community economic empowerment: Perspectives on watershed management and slum settlements in Makassar City, South Sulawesi, Indonesia. *Land*, 9(4), 104. <https://doi.org/10.3390/land9040104>
- Desai, V. M. (2018). Collaborative stakeholder engagement: An integration between theories of organizational legitimacy and learning. *Academy of Management Journal*, 61(1), 220-244. <https://doi.org/10.5465/amj.2016.0315>
- Haldane, V., Chuah, F. L., Srivastava, A., Singh, S. R., Koh, G. C., Seng, C. K., & Legido-Quigley, H. (2019). Community participation in health services development, implementation, and evaluation: A systematic review of empowerment, health, community, and process outcomes. *PloS one*, 14(5), e0216112. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0216112>
- Djafar, R., Syam, H., Raharjo, P., Abdussamad, J., & Akib, H. (2019). Reconstruction of poverty reduction strategy model based on community empowerment programs. *Academy of Entrepreneurship Journal*, 25(2), 1-10.
- Fetterman, D. (2019). Empowerment evaluation: A stakeholder involvement approach. *Health promotion journal of Australia: official journal of Australian Association of Health Promotion Professionals*, 30(2), 137-142.
- Fikri, F., Muchsin, A., & Semaun, S. (2019). Development of creative industries training towards sharia economic empowerment in Bilalangnge community, Parepare City, South Sulawesi. *Malaysian E Commerce Journal (MECJ)*, 3(2), 33-35. <http://doi.org/10.26480/mecj.02.2019.33.35>
- Amsler, L. B. (2016). Collaborative governance: Integrating management, politics, and law. *Public Administration Review*, 76(5), 700-711. <https://doi.org/10.1111/puar.12605>
- Zein, M. S. (2016). Government-based training agencies and the professional development of Indonesian teachers of English for Young Learners: perspectives from complexity theory. *Journal of Education for Teaching*, 42(2), 205-223. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02607476.2016.1143145>

- Arif, A., & Primastuti, A. (2016). Coastal Community Empowerment: Methods, Challenges and Solutions. *International Journal of Kybernology*, 3(1), 39-55. <https://doi.org/10.33701/ijok.v3i1.582>
- Eckerberg, K., Bjärstig, T., & Zachrisson, A. (2015). Incentives for collaborative governance: Top-down and bottom-up initiatives in the Swedish mountain region. *Mountain Research and Development*, 35(3), 289-298. <https://doi.org/10.1659/MRD-JOURNAL-D-14-00068.1>
- Rahman, M., & Farin, S. M. (2019). Rethinking development effectiveness: Insights from literature review. *Occasional Paper*, 53.
- Koontz, T. M., Jager, N. W., & Newig, J. (2020). Assessing collaborative conservation: A case survey of output, outcome, and impact measures used in the empirical literature. *Society & Natural Resources*, 33(4), 442-461. <https://doi.org/10.1080/08941920.2019.1583397>
- Green, G. P., & Haines, A. (2015). *Asset building & community development*. Sage publications.
- Khan, G. F. (2015). The Government 2.0 utilization model and implementation scenarios. *Information Development*, 31(2), 135-149. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0266666913502061>
- Liu, L. A., Adair, W. L., Tjosvold, D., & Poliakova, E. (2018). Understanding intercultural dynamics: Insights from competition and cooperation in complex contexts. *Cross Cultural & Strategic Management*, 25(1), 2-31. <https://doi.org/10.1108/CCSM-11-2017-0151>
- Fisher, E., Attah, R., Barca, V., O'Brien, C., Brook, S., Holland, J., ... & Pozarny, P. (2017). The livelihood impacts of cash transfers in sub-Saharan Africa: beneficiary perspectives from six countries. *World Development*, 99, 299-319. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.worlddev.2017.05.020>
- Andrijevic, M., Crespo Cuaresma, J., Muttarak, R., & Schleussner, C. F. (2020). Governance in socioeconomic pathways and its role for future adaptive capacity. *Nature Sustainability*, 3(1), 35-41.
- Koebele, E. A. (2019). Integrating collaborative governance theory with the Advocacy Coalition Framework. *Journal of Public Policy*, 39(1), 35-64. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0143814X18000041>
- Jagosh, J., Bush, P. L., Salsberg, J., Macaulay, A. C., Greenhalgh, T., Wong, G., ... & Pluye, P. (2015). A realist evaluation of community-based participatory research: partnership synergy, trust building and related ripple effects. *BMC public health*, 15(1), 725. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12889-015-1949-1>
- Kamara, R. D. (2017). Creating enhanced capacity for Local Economic Development (LED) through collaborative governance in South Africa.